Welcome. >> Good evening, everyone. Thank you so much for your patience. As a remainder, I am please note panel meetings are now being live streamed over the internet for the convenience of those unable to attend and a recording and transcript will be posted to the panel website following the meeting. Also please note that if you are you've signed up for public comment we will ask that you speak with one of the staff members in the audience. They would discuss that matter with you and take down specific information for follow up. Thank you in advance for your cooperation. Madam secretary can you please call roll >> Elzora Cleveland. >> Present. >> Deborah Dillingham. Norm Fruchter. Payne-Hanks, Lori Podvesker. Robert Powell. Benjamin Shuldiner, Roberto Soto-Carrion >> Present. >> Laura zinc is absent and Miguelina Zorilla Aristy >> Present. >> We're actually pleased to have two student representatives today. Jonathan and Caroline first introduce yourselves and share any remarks you'd like to share with us. You don't have a >> My name is Jonathan. I'm a senior. Very excited to be here. >> Thank you, Jonathan. [applause]. >> Hi I'm Caroline. I go to union square academy, a dental major and I am more excited than Jonathan to be here. [laughter] >> Welcome. Thank you. And now I'm going to ask folks to introduce themselves

please. Starting over there. >> Josh Wallack. >> Elizabeth Rose deputy chancellor operations. >> Norm Fruchter mayoral apointe. ee >> Elzora Cleveland >> Chief of staff DOE >> Court any jack San chase >> Vanessa Leuna >> Lori Podvesker >> Ben Shuldiner >> Eye Zach Carmignani marrieral appointee. >> Chief financial officer. >> Gerald Ross chair of the arts education committee. >> Paul king executive director for the arts. >> Thank you, everybody. The first order of business this evening will be approving minutes from September 29. Is there a motion to approve the minutes from the September 29 meeting? Thank you panel member Fruchter. Is there a second? Thank you panel member Cleveland. Please raise your hand if you vote to approve the minutes. Eight in favor, it's unanimous. >> Chancellor I know you'd like to share some remarks this evening. >> Yes. Well, the two student representatives are very excited but I think I'm even more excited. Because we've had a really a wonderful couple days. This weekend I was at Yale University taking part in something called the emotional revolution. Which is a collaboration between Dr. Mark Bracket from Yale study institute and lady Gaga and the whole conference was creating social emotional well-being in schools giving students more of a voice. to be able to talk about their feelings, their concerns and also having their opinions heard. In a very responsible way. I'm happy to say that we're going to be considered a strong partner in this collaboration. And I even got to meet lady Gaga so my stature

in in my grandson's eyes has gone up considerably. Listening to young people talk about what it means to have their voice heard is certainly part of what the mayor and I believe strongly what school is all about. We'll be talking more culture and getting everyone's voice. But we're going to be using some models they discussed this weekend and one of our schools that's been very involved, the upper lab will be one of our showcase schools so people can actually go and listen. Several of our superintendents have gone through the Yale institute trainina. About creating a social emotional climate and we anticipate this be filtering to many of our principalses. We announced that starting next year all 11th graders will be having the SAt's paid for in anywhere own schools. It's a big thing because many of you are students, A, don't necessarily have the funds, B, don't necessarily have the access to computers and filling applications. More importantly and I remember my days where you had to go take the test somewhere else, not in your own school, you had to go on a Saturday. I remember begaing a friend to take the test with me because it was a school I knew from the outside but I had heard all kind of things about it and was afraid to go on the inside. So we're going to have an SAT day during school day in your own school and parents need to pay no fees but also come with a curriculum that the college board is helping us with. We're starting in ninth grade there's going to be talking about college and what you need to do each year. We observe the nineties grade class where kids talk about why go to college and we anticipate the word college to start in prekindergarten. So it's all about how we get kids ready and also we're going to have a week at the end of January where we met with deans of all the universities in New York City and it's going to be a college week where we have financial aid information workshops with parents where we're also going to have visits to the college campuses with our middle school kids. So we're going all out to make sure everyone knows that college something that everyone can have access to. Today was one of the happiest days. A lot of things make me happy but going and hearing what we're going to be doing with the play Hamilton was a particular enthusiasm. Thank you for hosting. As a social studies buff that I am and understanding that American history can bring so many things alive, really get kids talking and excited. In my classroom I taught history all day, writing, reading, arts, to be able to meet the mirror Miranda family and having us come together so that 20,000 students in New York City 11th graders will going to see Hamilton for 10 dollars, being a very symbolic amount because I'm hoping we'll fight to keep ham inton on the 10 dollar bill but also the foundation has written a curriculum that every 11th grader in New York City is going to be learning from. So we're going to be talking about history in a way that matters. For those of you who haven't seen the play, I have to tell you it's one of the most unique experiences I've ever had in the theatre and identity a lost great ones. Closest thing I think I can relate it to is man of La Mancha. But this play is a multiracial cast, our kids will immediately identify with them. The day includes every student who comes will have prepared a monolog or skit back in their school with their theatre arts teachers to present on the stage. Then they will have lunch on Broadway, then they will see the play and then the cast members will come out and talk to them and engage them in conversations. You can't have a better day than that in New York City. The fact that 20,000 of our students are going to be partaking I've made a lot of new friends

in the principal world, I know Paul King has too. Everyone wants to know what do I do to get involved. I'm going to say wait your turn and you have to pay. I don't mean pay with finances but this is another way to get American history AP courses in schools because priority will be given to some of the schools that have done that and put them in or are in the process of doing it for next year. So all in all, a good week. Thank you. >> Thank you. So before we get under way with voting, I will say a few words about public comment and rules at this meeting. During the public comment period speakers will be permitted up to two minutes to comment. And I will ask the secretary to call speakers up from the sign up sheets. Make sure speakers finish comments in the allotted time. We don't have f we'll call speakers up in groups of five. If you have a green ticket you can go to my far right and yellow ticket proceed to the far left. The clock will indicate the amount of time remaining and light will indicate when there's one minute left. So that speakers will know when your time is up. At the conclusion of each speaker's time we'll move on to the next speaker. If a speaker is not here when his or her name called we will move on to the networks speaker and once we do that you cannot redeem your place in the queue. So the first item on tonight's agenda is a resolution to discuss diversity in school admissions in consideration for the removal of footnote 1 of Chan letter's regulation A101. At the August meeting panel member Fruchter introduced a motion to hold the discussion for the removal of footnote 1 of chancellor's regulation and the panel voted in the affirmative. Madam secretary could you please introduce the

resolution. >> The title of the resolution ss resolution to consider the removal of footnote one of chancellor's rotation a 10 1. >> Is there a motion to adopt this resolution? Thank you panel member Fruchter. Second? Thank panel member Cleveland. We're going to move to public comment on the resolution. >> There are no so because so few people have signed up we're going to do public comment on the regulations and the general public comment awe at once and move forward with the rest of the program. There are no electives so we can start with, if you have green or yellow tickets, and you signed up for regulations, if you could move towards either microphone and we'll go in order. The first person who signed up is shara baron from the education law center. >> I would ask folks who have ticket numbers to please come to the microphone. One through five. >> I'm from the education law center. At the August PEP meeting it was made clear the existing footnote in CRA 10 1 is a misstatement of the law. The Supreme Court the DOJ DOE and civil rights experts across the nation agree race conscious measures are legally permissible in voluntary desegregation plans. Not just when ordered by a court. So to delete the footnote will delete a falsehood. However, a purpose of the chancellor's regulations is to provide guidance. A failure to replace the footnote with the affirmative language with you suggest will provide no guidance to districts looking to voluntarily desegregate their schools. We heard at the August meeting the DOE used the foo et note to shut down district wide efforts to deseareaate. Even when those efforts did not use race as a criteria. So clearly the DOE and driblgts both need that guidance.

The proper auidance is a language we suggested language vetted in approved by national and local civil rights experts. To understand why we need that language let's go back to the 2007 U.S. Supreme Court decision. In it it said reducing racial isolation is a compelling interest in other words it should be a priority to desegregate New York City public schools. So districts must be given all the tools available to advance this compelling interest. Sometimes race neutral methods can chief that goal but the Supreme Court in our federal government recognize race neutral methods will not always work and when they don't it's permissible to use race conscious methods to achieve again this compelling interest. It's imperative districts and DOE know both categories of tools are available legally permissible race neutral and race conscious methods. The only way they will know this is to put the suggested language in in place of misstatement that currently exists in the footnote. The language reads school districts are strongly encouraged to consider legally permissible race conscious examine rate neutral approaches to promote diversity and reduce racial segregation. It's not controversial language. It's simply a correct statement of the law that will provide appropriate guidance. Thank you. >> Thank you. >> The next speaker is John August. From Brooklyn institute for liberal arts. >> I'll keep this brief because I'm actually here with one of my students. I'm his English teacher, and at the beginning of this year I decided because there's so much literature being published recently on school integration and how schools are still segregated and anybody who has walked through a school like the school I teach at on wind gate catch us is not going to argue schools aren't segregated. I decided that maybe it would be time for students to start speaking about this with each other. Under guidance of their teacher.

So I taught this unit and I got lots of responses from students to the question of whether or not they think that the New York City Department of Education should be making greater efforts to desegregate their schools and the responses were mixed and interesting. Some of them said I want to just got here from Jamaica but on the whole the under current of either pro or against desegregation was the fact that my students are very aware of the inequalities their faced with every time they come to my school. So Christopher who's right there is going to come up and read from his essay because I think that you guys maybe should hear from our students about what they feel about how schools are segregated and perhaps not treating them fairly and my hope is that an effort to integrate may actually help quell some of these issues my kids face every day. Thanks. >> There is actually we actually have some students here who are here to perform in response to the report, my understanding is they were told they would be able to get home and I know it's a school night. So I apologize but I'm hoping we'll take a break from the public comment right now and have our students perform for us. I apologize. Thank you. And they're coming. over. If you could give an intro, Mr. King. Thank you. >> (Off mic). >> Am I on? I want to introduce the dance company from science hills high school for science technology and creative arts. The dance teacher is Pat Dye. The principal is Dolly ma Gregor. I should point out this troop is one of five schools profiled in the PS dance video that you

all have copies of. Just an extraordinary tribute and a press as to the report from patent arts committee we thought it was really important that you all see live kids performina. And here we go. >> Thank you. [Performance]. [Singing]. (Applause). >> I want to thank the students. Very creative. Thank you. >> We're going to resume public comment. I would also note that [inaudible]. Next speaker Caitlyn McGuire. >> Hello. My name is Caitlyn Mc GUire. Representing district two for integrate a nonprofit organization that looks at how racial segregation impacts students in all aspects of think life and how we can work together as a community to diversify our school system. We attend a school with excellent funding, have technology mucus and arts and sports teams at our fingertips. Our school is statistically well integrated with we see the positive effects of this daily. Our classroom discussions are colorful and contain varying viewpoints. I've met students whose parents are UN ambassadors and came from rural farm lands and became NYU professors. Interactions likes these are crucial to produce well rounded global students. Amid this privilege is it be easy to forget not all schools are like that. A report found New York State public schools are the most segregated in the country. Many students of color are stuck in schools that receive less funding, space and resources. Students in segregated schools are 30 percent less likely to take and pass exams in algebra two, physics or chemistry and 50 percent more likely to be suspended the it's no longer acceptable to ignore the correlation. We respectful request the regulation be corrected by he deleting language that reads race possible considered an a factor in school enrollment only when required by court order and replaced with the following. School districts are strongly encouraged to consider legally permissible race conscious and race neutral approaches to promote diversity and reduce racial isolation. As a city we've a responsibility to make sure all our students are given equal high quality education. Thank you. >> Thank you. Next speaker with the green ticket number two. Sarah Kamasoli. >> Good evening. My name is Sarah Kamasoli and I'm a nine through 12ESL teacher in the founder and director of integrate NYC for me and have the privilege of being here with wonderful students. To give you background very much alliance with many some of the interests of current administration as we facilitate school to school exchanges between historically segregated public schools in New York City and advocacy projects with students to support the work bringing integration to one of most segregated districts in the country. Today we have three students from district seven, 17, and two, very diverse in their experiences and backgrounds. Who are committed to making this change. As they experience firsthand the impact of segregation. Whether benefitting from it or feeling like they don't. My request is you hear their words, feelings, their experiences and they're deep commitment to integration. I also request that it you consider their ask to change the footnote that discourages school tomorrow consider race and enrollment especially in a school system where we're currently being monitored by multiple research centers. The impact that particularly affects young people of color that qualify for free lunch who make

up the majority of the students that I teach. They are powerful, courageous, brilliant and they're resilient and I hope that when you listen to them you hear them as powerful thought partners in this work. Because I certainly do. The things they said come from their experiences doing school to school exchanges, doing advocacy projects, research, and their every day experiences. Whether from eating lunch to having or not having music and arts programs, having or not having sports, having or not having access to master teachers. Please listen fully and please work with them in collaboration. Thank you very much. >> Thank you. Next speaker yellow ticket No. 3. David Tipson. >> Hello, machines David tipson executive director of New York appleseed in partnership with the law firm. I am also the parent of a second grader and an a rising pre-K student. In a 2013 policy briefing New York appleseed identifieded footnote as inaccurate statement of constitutional law if in fact that's what it intends to be and a potential limitation on the ability of the department to address the city's unconscionable levels of racial segregation. I am here to add my voice to those calling for its removal from the regulation and replacement with an affirmative policy statement from the DOE recognizing benefits of diversity and prioritizing it in all decision making consistent with the City Council's yet unanswered resolution from May of this year. In the balance of my time I would like to note students, parents and community school district leaders across the city have developed credible and practical solutions to addressing school segregation in New York City. Particularly in our most rapidly changing areas. These groups are asking for DOE to be a real partner to them in exploring solutions to preserve equity of access.

It's time to exercise real leadership on this issue by embracing hands that have been extended to them and chart Agnew course away from the destructive patterns of segregation in our schools and neighborhoods. Thank you. >> Thank you. Next speaker green ticket No. 3. Shania Russell. >> Segregation is defined as act of setting two things apart based on differences. Segregation of people usually refers to separating groups of people based on background or race. This type of segregation is often imagined as something of the past. Historical issue that was solved years ago by marches and speeches sharing visions of a fixed future. The future desired in these visions was one of integration. Integration it he act of combining things considered separate to make them whole. Although we would like to believe for the sake of our own comfort this has already been achieved, we're not fully there. When it comes to public schools in New York and in the south Bronx especially, it is clear that although we have moved away from the values of segregation, we have not yet achieved integrated schools. In a way it seems we have moved away and then stopped. For us the idea of integration and setting equality is so important that we would like to continue moving in the right direction. The fact is segregation is an issue. Not only does it separate people but it harms them. Student from white schools for example, tend to get more resources and have better opportunities than students from pro come nantly schools of color. This means our education is being affected which is not something that can be ignored. We deserve and desire same level of education and the same opportunities as any other group of students. And this is just one of the negative effects.

There are many other factors involved in this. Stereotypes, boundaries between races and the external and internal conception that is result. Not only do outsiders look with certain thoughts and ideas but we begin to internalize what they feel and that's why this is an issue although it should be that although it should be of importance to everyone everywhere is especially urgent to us, we feel the need to address segregation because it has been occurring for too long and we have witnessed it first happen. That's why we have made it our goal everywhere we go to bring attention to the fact there are students who don't get the same opportunities as others. schools. We want to spread the idea of integration because it's a positive change for New York City public The kind of change that people can only benefit from. For that reason, we have come to express our concerns for regarding the Chancellor's regulation 101. Something as little as change in it the language of the footnote can achieve this change which is why we ask the wording be changed to school districts are strongly encouraged to consider legally permissible race conscious and race neutral approaches to promote diversity and reduce racial isolation. >> Thank you. >> Next speaker yellow ticket No. 4. Miriam Nunbera. >> My name is Miriam Nunberg and founder of Brock Lynn district 15 parents for middle school equity. We seek to reform our district wide middle school choice based admissions which results in segregation and vast achievement and opportunity gaps. This process has so loathed by parents and schools for being stressful and time consuming we've received over four hundred signatures demanding its reform. We have the proposed amendment to incorrectly interprets federal law.

In fact admission systems like ours that have a racially impact pose true potential legal violations. We have the proposed amendment to incorrectly interprets federal law. 400 signatures demanding its reform. In fact admission systems like ours that have a racially impact pose true potential legal violations. In examining school segregation OCR first asks if an admissions practice adversely impacts a given race or national origin. The answer in D15 is a resounding yes. Choice creates two sets of racially distinct middle schools. Although the district student body is about 25 percent white and 40 percent Latino the two most selected schools are 60 percent white and 20 percent Latino. 17 percent of the Latino attend three of 11 schools after 10 year-olds are interviewed auditioned and tested using fluid criteria. The segregation results in middle schools with disparate funding raising activities. After establishing the adverse impact of a district ratioly adverse policy, OCR asks if the policy is necessary to meet an important substantial legitimate educational goal. If not OCR would cite the district for discrimination. Positive effects of integrated schools we questioned sorting 10 year-olds into middle school. DOE has negative clearly articulate its purpose so many parents assume it's on 1 to prepare the white flight by protecting high performing well behaved students from the presumed disruption of the so called other students. We strongly question whether this is the legitimate educational objective that justifies segregation. In sum parents overwhelmingly support more equitable school assianment. Explicitly permit race conscious measures to reduce racial sizelation therefore respectfully request that the regulation be replaced with language that is a correct reflection of the law so the DOE can finally resolve the problems of school segregation in our district and across the city. Thank you.

>> Thank you. >> Next speaker green ticket four, first name is Chris, middle initialK. Green ticket four. First name Chris, middle initial K. >> The idea of school degags is based on belief that the dominant group has the best supplies go to the better schools. And has more opportunity. For example, I transferred to Brooklyn from the Bronx and went to school in wall ton campus next to Lindeman college. If you're familiar with the area you know the Bronx high school of science and Lee man high school are only blocks away. At that end of the school day not one black or Hispanic person can be located. It's a flood of white along with Asians it's blind blowing being in a building that houses five other schools and less than 15 blocks away is this specialized school that most of us will never attend sole lust because of the poor and lack of opportunities. School desegregation will decimate the feeling of inferiority. As a student you shun be farce today look for opportunities outside of my school while others have the Linux relative walking into a classroom and being presented with a series of high tech computers. This year only five percent of blacks are in specialized high schools. A black male will be less likely to prosper because of the lack of materials. He can only learn by so much in a school that can't obtain quality resources. Some might say if he works hard enough he could get into a better school to counter the U.S. education still separate and unequal states by age two disparities show between black and white children. Expressive vocabulary matching early counting math color knowledge and shapes. While 91 percent of white children age three to five who weren't enrolled in kindergarten were read to by family members three more times per

week. 78 percent of black children were read to with the same frequency. At such a young age the odds are already stacked against them. Because of the fact that his school is under performing his test scores won't be as high. Without good test scores school won't get money needed to acquire niece materials and opportunities. This boy will hopefully go on to college but because he wasn't properly prepared for it the chances of him graduating depletes. Possibly leading to him dropping out if he drops out the besides being and minority the chances of him getting a well paying job without completing college drops as well. All because of the dominant groups having the best leaving the minority with the scraps. As a student of district 17, practices have hidden derd my education. Not only does being an in a classroom with people bearing same skiing pigmentation as I do also inhibits our interaction with people whose skin color differs from our own. From elementary to high school I've been in schools where the majority is the minority. Because our textbooks state slavery was a secondary reason the Civil War transpired and according to page 126 in a textbook, slaves were workers. It's being embedded in our minds that our history is false. White students will go look learning and believing that slaves came to this country willing ly and won't be told the truce because our education isn't being educated, how can we chow or history into what's being taught, how will our voicings be heard if we're being ushered with people who look just like us. If enrollment practices were different, maybe we would be able to learn from one another. This is why I request that the footnote be changed. Thank you. >> Thank you. >> Yellow ticket No. 5. >> My name is Christopher Baptiste.

>> Yellow ticket five, Nala Rozario. While we're waiting, Caroline would like to our student representative would like to say a few recordings in response. few remarks. >> I already introduced myself. I am a student in AP language and we're studying rhetoric. And if I tell you this in the use of pathos how racially and schools are not equally divided. I can actually tell you that one percent of my school is white. And the other 99 percent are African-American or Hispanic. I go to a dental and pharmacy school where you expect people who want to pursue a higher education at a lower age in high school would be at and actually a lot of people are failing tire CT classes which is very sad in makes me sad to me because they're saying I'm black, where am I going to go, I'm not going anywhere. And recently I applied to a lot of my friends said why are you applying interest you're going to go there to get lynched. But a they evaporateder biometric is composed of 50 percent Asian and 50 percent white. It's not like that. They have a high percentage of Hispanics and African-Americans but obviously Caucasians are at a higher percentage rate but that's no reason for my friends to say stuff like that. I believe, sorry, this has started since freshman year in our social studies and government classes because they see all these African-Americans have been put down as you these Hispanics have been put down. If we don't begin with immigration policies we won't get anywhere in school. if we don't begin with immigration policies. >> Thank you. Our next speaker. >> Yellow ticket No. 5. Nala Rosario. If someone knows Ms. Rosario comes back let us know. The next speaker and final speaker for regulations

is Renee, I can't make out your last name. I know you're the lawyer from Orek >>I have two daughters who tend PS163. I also serve as pro bono counsel to law firm that has been working with apple seed and other advocates who have developed and tried to implement admission plans that seek to correct desegregation that exists in our public schools. It's segregation not caused correctly by housing patterns but rather in part by admission plans that DOE knows or should know maintain perpetuate the status quo. By way of example in data covering the 2011 to 12 school year 58 percent of children in district 13 didn't attend their zoned elementary school. 29 percent of children in district 15 did not attend their zoned elementary school. In my daughter's elementary school more than 50 percent of the children are not zoned for that school. At the same time, many schools are burdened with high numbers of at risk students and are dispro portal anytimely made up of students of color. The sfools schools are severely unfunded if and lack the resource to overcome especially equities putting the schools at a life lock disadvantage of because was an unregulated choice program that exists no New York City. Unfortunately footnote one in the Chancellor's regulations serves as a barrier to eliminating the injustice of segregation and is a plain misstatement of the law. This is confirmed by justice Kennedy's control opinion in the decision from 2007 and has been amplified by guidance issued by the Department of Education and the Department of Justice following the picks decision. History has shown that school districts can dramatically improve educational opportunities for all children with admissions plans that reduce racial isolation by ensuring to the fullest extent practicable racial and socioeconomic diversity. Racially converse schools afford enormous advantages to all children including but not limited to improved test scores, regardless of race or socioeconomic status.

Footnote one to the Chancellor's regulations is therefore a small but important impediment to allowing very positive change in all of our children's schools. In conclusion, I would urge you to act on the passionate and courageous voices you've heard you've heard from students all across the city and vote in favor of the proposed resolution. That would start the process of desegregating our schools. Thank you. >> Thank you. >> We will now move to general public comment. Green ticket No. 1 for general public comment. >> Good evening, panel. I'm here to talk about city charter No. 11 16V. It says any officer or employee of the city or of the agency who has knowingly make a false statement shall be guilty of misconduct. Because there is New York State's penal code 175. Miss Jackson chase, I've actually several times, many times, about a well known arbitration decision according to Ms. [inaudible], doesn't exist, I went to NYU. Not there. But according to your lawyers it exists. It's called fraud. The other day I went to another grievance and they mentioned a well known arbitration decision. According to UFT it doesn't exist. Said it's the city's policy to prohibit evidence of recordings at administrative hearings. According for the the UFT and will DOE have a nod. I have asked you about someone who wrote down a lie about my medication. Should I go about tell everybody what medication I take? Because it's truly heinous what was written about me. And you know it. I've asked you many times about this famous arbitration and well known arbitration. If it exists, provide it to me. If it doesn't those lawyers need to be arrested.

>> Next speaker, green ticket No. 2. From the academy of American studies students from the academy of American studies. >> So hi, we're student government representatives from the academy of American studies. And we're here representing our school. Our school is a really great school we're going into our 20th year of excellence and we have a very friendly environment. Our students hold themselves to very high standards however they work under difficulty school setting conditions. Our school is physically small. We hold have you are on own building but it's two floors and holds six classrooms and our school's population is about over 900 students and we share space with new comers high school. >> Okay. Our current environment denies our students of the library and science lab for ourselves. We share a lot of space including girls locker room and many classrooms with new comers students. It's crowded. Our private building is small with narrow hallways and about two staircases which we share and we have to like we share. We're only allowed one staircase in the building and only have the fourth floor. We're here asking for a new building. Or an expansion to our current building. We're not asking for ourselves but we're asking for future generations and future students for our school. We're promised by last Chancellor a very long time ago for a new building because of our great academic achievements. And it's simply our time to shine. >> Thank you. >> Thank you. >> I just want to take a moment to say that I've actually just sent deputy chancellor rose to visit your building. Yes, I did. I've also visited myself.

And you're absolutely right about the space. I want to make one little caveat here. We're looking at the building not just because you're high achieving school but because you need it because it's not the right building. So it has nothing to do with what type of students are in the building but it has to do with the building looks like that makes the decisions possible. >> So, yes, thank you for remembering me. I had a wonderful time visiting your building. And I actually saw both sides of it. There's no question that for the two schools that share the space, the space is not adequate. And we are assessing possible options that would help support increased capacity. Because both schools deserve to have space that they need to serve students. So thank you. >> Thank you. >> Thank you. >> Green ticket No. 3. General public comment. >> Good evening. I had the privilege of speaking from front of the panel last year and I discussed the polite of discontinued teachers. But unfortunately I received no response I decided to come more vocal. The theme of having your voice heard that the Chancellor mentioned tonight I would like my voice heard as well. At the beginning of the 2013, 2014 school year, I was placed in not one, not two, not three, but four high schools across Staten Island island. as a school schools one being district 75 school as well. I couldn't possibly complete all those case and knowing that the schools were in Jeopardy of being rated poorly for so many cases being out compliance, they decided to pick on me to be discontinued. Bad enough that I was wrongly discontinued but not only did they not allow me to work in Staten Island or work in any high school in any of the other five boroughs, they blacklisted me from

working ever again for the DOE. You think I would be accused of regent scrubbing for the punished I received but if I was accused of that or falsifying any documents for that matter I would still be allowed to work for the DOE. So how am I paying more my bills? I work as a direct care provider in a day rehabilitation center for the developmentally disabled making 14.50 an hour. I received much satisfaction working with this population, especially since I worked with the great teachers previously but I believe my master's degree I should be making more including the fact that I have more knowledge and education than any of the current principals working for DOE. And I'm left out of an education system. I ask you when is it time for the administration to be held accountable? Silence is complicit. I don't want someone taking down my email address because I've tried that before and I haven't received a response. I'll asking you Chancellor to rose to her position due to many qualification but first and foremost an educator like all of us to make reform and allow us the 600 of us who have been discontinued off the past three years to let us back into the system. We'll be all be waiting for the response. Because the UFT solidarity group is not backing down. Thank you. >> Green ticket No. 4. Public comment. >> Hello, everyone. My name is onyx walker. I have a few questions I'd like to ask the Chancellor. The first one is what is the data showing about patterns of suspensions, arrests, and dispro portionality by race, disability, and neighborhood? The last one is how are the leadership team recommendations reflected and budget priorities for next year? Thank you.

>> One of the things I can answer directly is that our suspensions are down city wide considerably. We have changed certainly some of the behavior codes and I think in a more positive way. And this is something this particular administration takes extremely seriously. But if it you leave me your name and something I can write you to I'll give you all the other information in writing >> Is my name is >> You have to write it down so I remember. >> You want me to write it down >> Yes, would you please? >> We have your name and cell phone number actually on sign-in sheet. >> I need an address. >> Sir? Can you give us an address? The person >> Or the 62 school. >> Thank you very much. >> At your school. >> Speaker No. 5. >> Good evening. Hello Chancellor. Chancellor, how long are you going to look the other way when it ms could abusive bullying principles? We've been speaking to you my wife and I about the principal at PS34Q as one of these incompetent abusive principals. Lasted year teach turnover rate was 25 percent and since September the school has lost four teachers who have already guit from PS34q. This school needs to be investigated. They are out of compliance for failure to uphold IEPs and ELL ratios. Couple this with the letter sent to you signed by several teachers at PS340 detailing how the principal tampered with the school's quality review which your office is still not investigated even though Ms. Jackson brown said in March of last year there are self investigations that are ongoing. My wife and I have come to you many times to expose this principal. At the July PEP meeting your chief of staff Ms.

Jackson chase came to you on your behalf and told my wife DOE was going to give her a second chance and was going to put her back into the system. Ms. Jackson chase had my wife speak to Adam Ross from UFT to represent her once that was done HR would come and take over. I have an email from miss Jackson chase, miss gut man as you know I'm reviewing your history based upon your complaint. I'm writing to inform you that new information has come to my attention requiring the additional review. At this time you do not need to have a representative from the UFT to assist in regards. Once I've completed the review, I will reach out to you. We've never heard what other information came to light but again so we then get a response on September 8, Ms. Gut man I've explained to you I've done a complete legal review of your discontinues and everything appeared to be in order. You said you had additional concerns and I asked you to send them to me so I could follow up. We came back to you. Several times. In the last email I'm going to read to you Ms. Jackson chase you still have not answered my auestion. How is that given due process when my principal committed mentor fraud, how can you explain the principal committing mentor fraud, how I was forwarded due process when every first New York City city is required to have a mentor. Principal must show they gave support before assigning a U rating first support given is a mentor. I received an exemption letter from the principal claiming to have worked at PS34 for two years, this is clearly not true. Again, this is mentor fraud. The New York City has mentor guide for principals according to the guide as a first year teacher I was mandated to have a mentor. I've asked you numerous times why the DOE is covering

up for principal Pauline chase blatant mentor fraud and asked you about other issues regarding her testimony she rated me using the Danielle son framework in the year 2010, 2011. You have yet to respond. >> Mr. Gut man I'm going to ask you to wrap up, please. >> Am I asking too much to ask why my wife was denied a mentor and how due process was served if she if she was not begin a monitor? How was she supported? >> Thank you. >> Last speaker for general public comment, looks like you were begin ticket No. 16, Mr. Portelos but I think you're the last speaker. >> Good afternoon. Sorry, good evening. I'm a parent educator and union activist. Parent for obvious reasons. I'm a father of two boys. An educator because when I was an engineer on the bridge and tunnels, I felt that I was making too much money and not doing enough. I know, it's crazy. So I decided to take a cut in salary and join my wife in the education field and I despite everything that's happening and I know some of you you have up there especially Ms. Jackson chase a lot has happened in the last several years. I don't rearet it. Because the look in the eye of a student who gets it when you show them something and that spark, you can't really put a price tag on that. And I'm a union activist because we have issues in our education system. Horrific issues. Two minutes, a minute and five says is definitely not enough. So we turn to social media and we share and we share and we post and we come here Mr. Gut man my hat's off to you. Sometimes when you can't make the meetings I sit home and watch them on TV and other people watching reality shows I'm watching a different reality show.

Except I'd rather watch the other shows because this is it's sad. It's sad that members are being abused. It's sad that I know it's been about two thousand non-tenured teachers terminated without getting a second chance. Luckily I was tenured when I caught my principal stealing money from our school, and despite being under 37 investigations, after I called her out on it, I survived in front of a classroom today because I was tenured. But what we need to do, and my hat's office to Mr. Isaac Carmignani, because he's the only one who responds. Over there. I'm sorry. He's the only one who responses to my emails to the panel. But you're the panel for education policy. Key word there is policy. Can't you just make some tweaks and changes to allow these discontinued teachers to be cleared throw OPI, office of personnel version, ahead of time? What's happening is and it's others here that aren't speaking tonight and countless more at home, they're getting jobs offers, principals are coming in and saying give us them a lesson. That was great. HR, let's put you in. What's this in a problem code? You have to go through OPI. OPI takes weeks to clear them. Principal needs someone and they say I'm sorry, I have to move on. This happens over and over. Clear them first and allow them to get a job at least in a different district. Also stop harassing them for calling out special ed complaints. Thanks for the extra time. >> Thank you. >> I want to apologize, I was a few minutes late.

in arriving. I just have a delivery. And a quick report if that's all right. >> Sure. Can you state your name. >> 0kay. My name is Debra Mc Gowen coming from district 30. A parent. My daughter and son both go to PS11 under currently under construction. Basically addressing the overcrowding issues that are going on in our neighborhood. You guys kindly reported back, excuse me, replied back to our petition of 630 signatures with a resounding no saying that a building an addition onto IS125 in district 24 was going to service our middle school seats. We really don't agree with that. So we have a reput he will. We also have some site solutions for you. Two of them are government pieces of land that are centralized to our neighborhood. They're equidistance from P.S. 150, P.S. 11, P.S. 361 and 151 and they're on a bus route. We had over a hundred parents come out for this rally along with a bunch of their kids. We had a good time. But it is definitely a concern. Going through some of past news reports, back in March of this year, when you spoke to the City Council, it was recognized that 16,000 seats were not going to be accommodated for in the capital plan. And I feel that we should address some of those seats in our area. 1900 seats are being promised to district 30. My concern is that they're not enough. Because you're building a lot of elementary and the kids are growing up. Thank you. >> Thank you. >> Go ahead. I don't

>> We don't know what to do >> I don't either. >> We good? >> There we go. Thank you, we will take a look at the report and the suggestions. the city. We do know that we wish we could fund all of the seats that we would like to fund throughout We will continue we will take a look at this. And we do continue to update and our enrollment projections and capacity projections on an annual basis. So that we can take a look at changing conditions in districts. No promises. But we will take a look at what you've brought. Thank you. >> Thank you. That concludes our public comment period. We're going to go back to the original rogsz. Are there any questions or comments from the panel to consider the removal of footnote one of Chancellor resolution A 10 1. >> We were joined by Panel Member Debra Dillingham quite some time ago. >> Panel Member Fruchter? >> My hope is that we have the votes tonight to pass the resolution to remove the footnote so that we can end this mini epic of footnote that shouldn't have been there in the first place. I think it's clear from the testimony that we've had that the footnote misstates what the both the law and what the US DOE is telling us about what we can and can't do. My concern is the chilling effect that the footnote has on efforts that diversity to increase diversity and to reduce segregation across the system. I used to believe when I was a school board member in a Brooklyn district that because well I used to believe that housing segregation was what determined schooling segregation. And that there wasn't much you could do about it

in New York City given the patterns of housing that existed. But over the years what I've seen is that in several districts, district 1 certainly, lots of work was done to increase diversity of the district schools, other districts, 13, 15, made what I thought were really useful and interesting changes. a bunch of individual schools have worked across the years to try to diversify their student body by changing their enrollment patterns. The Chancellor has created some 40 or 50 dual language schools which I think contributes might ily to diversity. And so I think we need to do two things as a panel. We need to vote tonight to get rid of the footnote and then we need to consider the best way to make an affirmative statement about what the DOE's, I hated to say position, but philosophy and stance should be about increasing diversity across the school system. >> Thank you. Panel Member Carmignani? >> So I would have to concur with Panel Member Fruchter on this. Even if we decouple the two issues, the footnote as opposed to what language we go forward with, as I see it after reading the Kennedy opinion and the Department of Justice's interpretation, it would appear that what many of the advocates are saying krurz with that. concurs with that. Skrikth have tools in their tool kits for dealing with diversity as has been mentioned by several in the audience. And what we do going forward, still to be determined. But I would tend to agree with what is being said by advocates out there. >> Panel Member Cleveland? >> It's very clear that the Chancellor has shown to the public, to everyone, that diversity is key. And so I, too, belief first and foremost, we want nothing to reflect an error on behalf of the Department of Education. And so I am supporting the removal of that language.

But I do want clarity in what we understand that opportunity, that change, to be. And, again, our Chancellor has done amazing work already. And I know that this is something that we could continue looking into and really putting our foot down and making a change. Thank you. >> Any further comments? Okay. We will now move on to vote on the resolution. Madam secretary could you note any recusals >> No recusals on this item >> Please raise your hand if you vote to approve the resolution to consider the removal of footnote one of the Chancellor's regulation A 101. >> I have a vote of 10 which makes it unanimous. >> Thank you. So be it resolved the panel hereby recommends that footnote 10 be removed from Chancellor's regulations A 10 1. Chancellor Farina do you accept the panel's recommendation >> Yes, I accept the panel's recommendation to consider the removal of the footnote. >> So in accordance with the law as the Chancellor has agreed to amend the regulation as recommended by the PEP we will post the amended regulation for a minimum of 45 days for public comment. And the PEP will then vote on the amendment to CRA 10 1 and the proposed amendment will be the removal of footnote 1 of Chancellor's regulation A 101. So now thank you we will hear presentation from the arts advisory committee to the panel. I'd like to ask Paul king executive director of arts and special projects and committee chair Gerald Ross to share the committee as annual report with the panel. Thank you very much. >> Thank you for affording us the time to deliver this report. Many years ago my one my doctors said if you waited long enough, as your hair turn gray or

white, it would stay in. Obviously he was wrong. If a few more hairs fell out tonight. Two events occurred within the last 10 days, the first I'll refer to refer to very briefly. The first was the address to the American people by the president of the United States in his regularly scheduled television program. And he called for much less test time in classrooms. As a substitute, he offered three possibilities, but the first three that came to his mind and of those three, the first was wouldn't you rather have your child play a musical instrument? So the effect of the awakening of people to the importance of the arts has now reached the Whitehouse and hopefully will be reflected in the decisions of the PEP. David Brooks on October 6 in the New York Times wrote if a student spends x number of years in regular and concentrated beauty with poetry or music, there's a good chance something trans sent end will happen. In the past years I've come before you to read the report of the arts education committee, but since you've had it for some time, and most likely have read it before tonight, and since it's its drafting was so masterfully done by the executive director of arts connection then edited by the full committee, there's no need to repeat it. The report is replete with successes by the office of arts and special projects, headed by Paul King, and his longstanding as well as newest staff. So I will just highlight the major recommendations we're making to you with additional evidence that creative thinkers in many professions echo our call to expand students in the arts so that all our children may begin to think long-range and we to begin to think long rain and city wide to ensure their influence on thoughts of the children now and for the remainder of their lives. Our response to all the children and their teaches is contained within this report. At this point I'd like to introduce the members

of the committee that very handsome block of people center right includes would you [as I call your name. Jodv Arnhold. Sarah Calderon. Betsy Dubobski. Sharon Dunn. Debra Jackson, assistant administrator of the Robert Lee man collection at the metropolitan museum of art. Valerie Luzonis. Carrie McCarthy. I gather she went off to another meeting to give away more of the trust's money which is a good thina. Stephen Tennen executive director arts connection. George Young, assistant director of the council of school supervisors and administrators. And Maria palmer, deputy executive officer office of arts and special projects of the New York City DOE. Just about 50 years ago I was student teaching at a high school known even then as the drugstore. The music class was popular with everyone because it was rest full and didn't demand much. Although the teacher did care about her students. She asked me to present a lesson on, her approach was to play a record of the life of Chakeski and test the students. Sound familiar? I asked to do something different I compared the overture with several the sondz of west side story. And a hit on product bay. How composers of different ages handled the universal theme of young love created a class session that woke everyone up and in which everyone was intent on not just the beauty of the music but it's structure, choice of musical forms, its compelling story, set in two different timeframes, and two very, very different locales. When I asked why each compose are wrote the way he did there were many hands in the air. One boy especially replied startingly connecting each of the above areas to one another.

He had an unusual mind. My teacher when evaluating my lesson told me that this young man was failing music. Obviously he was an unrecognized leader and possessed the qualities to be a great leader based on this display of intelligence that captured the interest of his classmates as well. All these years later I still wonder what happened to him and the thousands of other hat lat Latino males who were never challenged and the teachers expectations of their abilities were woefully inadequate. Did he become another example of the hollowing out of our society as pointed to lately by the president of new America. Contrast this with the middle school arts boot camp program made possible with the mayor's 23 million dollars this past year in a note sent to the office of the arts. Ouote. Navigating the public high school process is one of the most stressful events in a student's life. Arts, young learners I'm sorry, arts audition boot camp not only provided us with the service we could never provide or afford on our own, it gave my child confidence and helped make known the otherwise terrifying unknown that is the audition process. I can't thank the instructors and administrators enough for giving my child an experience that will help her achieve her dreams and get her closer to the education that we pray for for our children. Unquote. We propose that our report be viewed as more than just the sum of its parts. Even as we have separated out the most significant issues facing us for the purposes of explication. It is imperative to think differently and in an interrelated fashion. Following our chief priorities with a view to connecting them all, they are much more detailed in the written report connecting them all. And in the written report you have received.

The PEP working together with America's best school Chancellor should monitor the implementation of these priorities. You can applaud over there if you like. [laughter]. [applause]. Professional development for teachers, especially at the pre-K level where learning habits are acquired needs to be fostered by a full apprehension of the connectivity of the arts to other curriculum areas. This is the essence of the real intent of total learning and it not continue to be restricted by two narrow a definition of artistic and aesthetic needs of children at this age. Absent the arts in pre-K classrooms, children cannot learn effectively and with the joy that must be associated with their growth and development. This is especially significant in the lives of disabled children as well as for those whose English not their navy language. We were talking about diversity for guite a while here. This is what diversity really means and what the arts can do to engage in the elimination of the lack of diversity. Such expansion would widen those reached from 581 teachers to all in the city system. It should link music, art, dance, and theatre to the development of the imagination to investigate the world, to explore movement, and to story-telling that engages young learners through creative play long-known in the research on education to be the best avenue for learning at this level. Taken together, our recommendations call for the development of lifetime intellectual habits to be solidified in the middle schools. Habits of thinking, of behavior, of civility that are engendered by a broad knowledge. Way artists plan, work and deliver their message. We must attend to this message and recognize that it is the way through which the most creative vet disciplined learning takes place as a model for teaching and learning in all areas. Current state requirements for arts teach certification restricting arts classes to a paltry

number of hours of instruction detailed in the full report are severely limiting and take away any possibility of the sequential nature of arts education in any discipline or in any discipline in middle schools. The state instructional requirements must be revisited and the DOE must carry this message directly to the newly appointed state commissioner of education. The second event that happened this week was a report this morning that the chances of New York State board of regents has resoind. This may open the way to a fuller discussion of what we are talking about here tonight. ianed. This may open the way to a fuller discussion of what we are talking about here tonight. I have to say that I've known Merril since she was a child. I think I've known just about everybody since they were children. And have the you the mote respect for her but I don't always agree with her. There needs to be less as President Obama said, emphasis on testing and more on creativity. Our report as well, the challenge of very small and/or collated co-located middle schools is great. Budgets for the arts in small schools are not nearly adequate. We encourage the Chancellor to facilitate arts instruction by permitting f status teachers possibly retired all specialist or teaching artists with certification as per diem session teachers and to share the services of art specialists as a realistic way of assuring arts instruction. Our report calls for the expansion of the arts audition boot camp praised so highly above by a parent so that the success of just 149 students deserves to be built to a scale where every middle school child has access to the schools they will need both in school and in the job market. There are other specific references as well.

The excellent programs begun under last year's

23 million dollars arts and investment must be continued and expanded. The current four-year commitment needs to be protected long term for every school. Inspired by the possibilities inherent at the pre-K level our referencing of training for parents must now be consummated at all levels in full association with cultural institutions. whose presence in the schools and in after school and weekend activities needs to be more system atic. Supported by formal school and cultural partnerships. Such partnerships should include special instructions for parents based on how the schools see cultural institutions adding to the excitement of children experiencing the arts. Parents should be guided to explore the arts along with their children. These partnerships which have been eagerly sought by the Chancellor cannot continue to be drive-byes alone in classrooms with too many artists dropping in and out of schools and little or no follow up with the children. They're teachers and they're parents. Even when the experiences have been of high quality. As such a plan is developed, progress must be assessed by a rigorous and fully financially supported budget. Quality depends on a serious, long range financial commitment by the DOE. Spearheaded by the Chancellor without and the PEP. without possibility of retrogression. The result will also be the creation of a large cadre of arts advocates who will demand that their children continue to have arts instruction at every level. We tend to think of relationships to higher education teacher preparation and to business and jobs as efforts directed at disparate communities without connection one to the other. Even our own report separates them out for clarity, but the time has tomorrow to develop a comprehensive plan in which the intellectual, emotional, and aesthetic powers of the creation meaning, and intent of arts instruction must be recognized. It must be fully supported in practice as well

as rhetoric. By means of a well-forged unbreakable chain link by link creating policies from pre-K through graduate school that will sustain meaning and future possibilities for our children, our teachers, and our school leaders. A total school curriculum and the manner in which it is created, implemented and enforced will attract and fascinate children. The mathematician and philosopher add frequently north Whitehead called it wonder. That will attract and keep children in school at a time in our history when we cannot afford to fail them nor allow them to fail. To that end, finally, we are proposing a cross-agency study to determine over and above the annual arts report where there are and where there are not arts services. We need an arts education map of the city to understand fully where teachers are placed, where arts organizations reside, and work, and whether arts programs exist within and/or after the school day. We also need financial data as to how much it would cost to meet arts requirements outlined by the state. Finally, and we need demographics to predict changes in the city's population over the next five years. at least. Obtaining a larger grasp of the entire situation, we will then be in an even better position to bind our proposals as a whole and to insist that as in that unbreakable chain, they cannot be considered one link at a time but as a whole. Limiting or setting aside even one link destroys the strength of the chain and thereby the future for our children in the arts. This is central to the distinctive American democratic way of life. We must value the arts as every great civilization has done in the past. It has been the defining factor in their greatness. Reinforcing this, the poet Keats wrote by denying children access to beauty, we are also denying them the delight of discovering truth.

In closing let us also recall the words of Johnson when he signed the bill creating the national endowment for the arts into law. He said. : Art is a nation's most precious heritage. For it is in our works of art that we reveal to ourselves and others the inner vision which quides us as a nation. And when there is no vision, the people perish. Thank you for listening. (Applause) >> I want I want to thank Dr. Ross and the committee for this. Those of how know me well know I do not need any convincina. Many of the things in the report have already started to take place. Certainly the training of our pre-K teachers we started in one art form working with studio of the school, just contingently I have a meeting with tomorrow Cahill tomorrow to continue the discussion. Jsh and I have been talking about adding another art form. to the pre-K. So we're ahead on that one. F status I have always actually encouraged. There isn't a teacher who doesn't retire from the system that I don't figure a way to use them if they're the right person. And also last year many of you may not know but George was one of your schools, we had performances every Friday at tweed from dinner schools around the city to encourage the fact that arts do change an atmosphere and if there's anyplace that needed changing it was Tweed. So having music and dance and other things is important. So there's nothing here that runs counter to what the philosophy is. I do think that we need to have more schools understand also that there are multiple art forms and I was just in a school today where the principal's comment to me was we need to change some of the regulations so someone is passionate in his school happens to be music, they can

do three years of music and not have to do a year of this and a year of that. I think there's money to be spent but more there's some intellectual manpower that has to take place. And so certainly regulations have to change. So we're working on all forces and I'm thrilled that Paul King works for me and is heading this up. So I do think you can count on more arts and more arts and more arts. [applause]. >> Thank you again. Dr. Ross. So the ves? >> Sorry. >> Please. >> I took notes on the aforementioned speaker and I was have I heavily influenced by what he was saying. I've seen the work that PEP has done with after school activities and in remembrance to him I would like to bring a proposal up. So that the one percent will flip to the 99 percent and vice versa. Model congress has made me who I am. Why not begin in pre-K, why does it start at such a young age. Why not begin SAT classes if we don't want it taken off of the college admission process, why not begin with after school activities instead of subject tests? I know that I got a 1360 out of 24 hundred on the SATs and that doesn't define me as a person. I'm if I could attach a video of me from model congress to my college application that would be who I am. This person who I'm speaking this person speaking now is who I am. Not the girl that I was when I sat in a six hour classroom taking my SATs after waiting an hour outside. Parents drive their students to school, I take the train.

Parents enforce them to take classes from arade six. I took them in ninth grade. I know that's only three year difference but that three year difference caused my friend to get a 1800 on her SATs while I got a 1360. The amount black has he and Asians who scored low is out rages. I had like to swipe the same metro card to get into the real world where my test scores shouldn't define me as a person but my after school activities do. Why at Yale University on December 30 to six there will be a conference held and I want to run at president and I have to run on the democratic platform. I would like to represent burny Sanders on that day. I know what especially the other day about immigration policies away motivational but let's take it back to SAT scores. Vanderbilt university ever know that AP biology teacher got sick in December and the most of us got twos and threes. No, they will know know she got sick. Toss my mom know I'm here? My nom is a Spanish speaking person. I'm the first graduate of my family. And I'm not as part of that as I should be why? Because a lot of people who are first graduating kids don't, aren't motivated enough, like me and I don't know than for example, to apply to high achieving schools. They feel like these schools don't need them, don't wanted them because of their SAT grades. Now, I know I touched upon a lot of bases, Chancellor but if this was a baseball game, who would actually win? >> Thank you, Caroline. >> We're moving on to the next voting item which is the approval of the aggregation of the city board and the Chancellor. Madam secretary please present the resolving. >> The resolution is entitled resolution regarding the agenciry gags of community district budgets together with a proposed budget for administrative

expenditures of city board and Chancellor >> Motion to adopt the resolution being considered tonight? Thank you Panel Member frushgt. **Fruchter?** Second. Thank you Panel Member pulmonary. Powell. Panel Members have any questions or concerns regarding for administrative expenditures of the city board and the chancellor? >> I should note for the record that there was no one signed up for public comment on this item. >> Thank you. No discussion? All right. So please please raise your hand if you vote to approve the aggregation of community district budgets together with a proposed budget for administrative expenditures for the board and the Chancellor. 10 in favor, it's unanimous. >> Thank you. The next item requiring a vote is the consideration of contracts. I will now ask that contracts committee I was there. [laughter] >> Was anyone else there? >> You weren't there. You were Skyped. Both of you. Okay. I will ask contracts committee member eye Zach Carmignani to summarize the contracts committee recommendses regarding the contracts listed on tonight's engine. >> Thank you. >> The contracts committee met on Thursday October 22nd, and reviewed the contracts being considered by the panel tonight. I met with contracts committee members Vanessa Leon Baptiste and Lori Podvesker. At the meeting the committee unanimously recommended

the approval of contract items 1 through 17. The contracts committee recommends contract items 1 through 17 be considered in three resolutions. Resolution 1, contract items 1 through three, resolution two, contract items four through 13. Resolution three, contract item 14, 16, and 17. >> Thank you, Panel Member Carmignani. Before we begin Mr. Ross do you have any texts you had like to read into the minutes pertaining to today's contract items >> I do thank you. First I note I provided panel members with technical changes to universal prekindergarten contracts that have been approved by panel at prior meetings and that these changes have been posted on the web. An additional technical changes included here with. At legitimacy June 10, 2015, meeting item six the panel approved a contract with quest are to provide assessment materials and support the middle school quality initiative the panel agenda listed the contract amounts incorrectly at three hundred 39 thousand nine hundred 38 dollars. The correct amounts as listed in the request is 368, 22 7.50. As July 29, 2015, meeting I'm panel approved a contract with scan, aids association to provide conflict resolution family support and student health programs, the agenda indicated the annual amount was 40 thousand dollars but the RA correctly reflected the amount at 80 thousand dollars. The agenda for item three on this month's agenda incorrectly indicated indicates the vendor's name at teacher college Columbia University. Reading and writing project. The correct name is teachers college Columbia University center for technology and school change as indicated correctly on the request for authorization. The agenda for item one on this month's agenda a contract with vanguard direct indicates the term is three without specifying units. The correct term is three years as indicated on the RA. The agenda for item 12 on this month's agenda a contract with a learning connection incorrectly

indicates the annual amount is three hundred 16 thousand six hundred 26 dollars. The correct annual amount is 316, 712 as indicated on the request for authorization. Finally the agenda for item 7 on this month's agenda a contract with teacher created materials incorrectly indicates the annual amount is three million and 18 thousand six hundred 94 dollars the correct annual amount is 1 million five hundred 24 thousand four hundred dollars as indicated on the request for authorization. Thank you. >> Thank you, Mr. Ross. Madam secretary could you please present the three resolution set forth by the contracts committee. >> The resolutions are all entitled resolution regarding the approval of contracts and as indicated by Panel Member Carmignani the first resolution contains contract items 1 through three, the second resolution contains contract items four threw 13, the and the third resolution contains contract items 14, 16, and 17. Panel Member please note if you wish to vote differently for a specific contract item within a single resolution you may do so. Simply signal to me when the vote is called for the relevant resolution and indicate the item number within that resolution and your corresponding vote. >> Thank you, is there a motion to adopt the resolutions being considered tonight thank you Panel Member Fruchter. Is there a second. Thank you Panel Member Powell. Does the panel have any questions or concerns regarding tonight's contracts? So we'll vote on the resolution. Madam secretary could you note any recusals. Please raise your hand if you vote to approve the resolution regarding approval the contract items one through three. >> 10 in favor, unanimous. >> Please raise your hand if you vote to approval resolution regarding approval of contract items 4 through 13. >> 10 in favor.

Unanimous. >> And finally please raise your hand if you vote to approve resolution regarding approval of contract items 14, 16, 17. >> 10 in favor. It's unanimous. >> So that concludes our meeting. Any comments? All right. >> For the record to say let's go Mets. >> And we are missing the first game of the series. So the next regular meeting of the PEP will be held Thursday, November 19, 2015. At MS131 at 100Hester Street. The meeting is now adjourned. Thank you, good night everyone. Get home safely.